

# Overview of scores of FSC International, FSC Sweden, FSC Brazil and the interim standard of ICILA for Cameroon

**March 2011**

## Introduction

The Timber Procurement Assessment Committee (TPAC) assesses certification systems for timber on behalf of the Dutch Procurement Policy.

In June 2009, TPAC published its final assessment results on FSC International. Although the TPAC assessment focussed on the generic, international standard and the accompanying international documents, the Committee also performed *cross-checks*<sup>1</sup> of the national FSC initiatives of Sweden and Brazil in 2008. In addition, the Committee performed a cross-check of the so-called *Locally Adapted Generic Standard* (LAGS) of ICILA for Cameroon. LAGSs are operated by certification bodies in countries which do not (yet) have a national FSC standard. The outcome of these cross-checks was not yet published on the TPAC website.

This document gives an overview of the scores for of FSC International, - Sweden and Brazil, as well as of the LAGS of ICILA for Cameroon. For the majority of the principles and criteria, the four have an identical score. In some cases, the scores do vary; for example because the national standards include detailed indicators for the national level.<sup>2</sup>

The Dutch Procurement Criteria are structured in three matrices:

- Sustainable Forest Management (SFM);
- Chain-of-Custody and Logo Use (CoC);
- Development, Application and Management of certification systems (DAM).

As all initiatives use the same standard for the Chain-of-Custody, their scores for the TPAC CoC criteria are identical.

---

<sup>1</sup> A cross check is a very short assessment, excluding amongst others the review and stakeholder forum.

<sup>2</sup> In October 2008 TPAC published its Judgement on FSC International. In June 2009, however, based on comparisons with other certification systems, the Committee decided that a revision of the scores of FSC International on SFM criteria 5.1, 5.2 and 5.3 was appropriate. As a result, the initial score of '2' on Principle 5 was revised to a score of '1'. This had however no effect on the overall judgement that FSC International was conforming to the Dutch Procurement Criteria. It should be noted that this revision was not performed for the cross-checks of FSC Sweden, FSC Brazil and the LAGS of ICILA for Cameroon.

## Sustainable Forest Management (SFM)

<b>Legislation and Regulation</b>		<b>FSC Int.</b>	<b>FSC Sweden</b>	<b>FSC Brazil</b>	<b>ICILA (Cam.)</b>
Legislation and regulation	P 1. Relevant international, national, and regional/local legislation and regulations shall be respected. To that end the system requires that:	2	2	2	2
Requirements of forest manager	C 1.1. The forest manager holds legal use rights to the forest.	=	=	=	=
	C 1.2. The forest manager complies with all obligations to pay taxes and royalties.	=	=	=	=
	C 1.3. Legal and regulatory obligations that apply to the forest management unit, including international agreements, are fulfilled.	=	=	=	=
Illegal activities	C 1.4. The forest management unit is sufficiently protected against all forms of illegal exploitation, illegal establishment of settlements, illegal land use, illegally initiated fires, and other illegal activities.	=	=	=	=
<b>Social Aspects</b>					
Interests of stakeholders	P 2. The interests of directly and indirectly involved stakeholders shall be taken into account. To that end the system requires that:	2	2	2	2
Tenure and use rights	C 2.1. The legal status of the management of the forest management unit and claims of the local population, including indigenous peoples, regarding the property/tenure or use rights in the forest management unit or a portion thereof have been inventoried and are respected.	=	=	=	=
Consultation and permission	C 2.2. Effective communication with and consultation and participation of stakeholders take place regarding the management of the forests.	=	=	=	=
	C 2.3. The local population and indigenous peoples have a say on the basis of free and informed consent, and hold the right to grant or withhold permission and, if relevant, receive compensation where their property/use rights are at stake.	=	=	=	=
Public availability	C 2.4. The forest management plan and accompanying maps, relevant monitoring results and information about the forest management measures to be applied are publicly available, except for strictly confidential business information.	=	=	=	=
Dispute resolution	C 2.5. Adequate mechanisms are in place for resolving disputes regarding forest management, property/usage rights, work conditions, or social services.	=	=	=	=
Objects of cultural and economic value	C 2.6. Objects of cultural and traditional economic value are identified and inventoried in consultation with the stakeholders, and are respected.	=	=	=	=

Health and labour conditions	P 3. Safety, health, and labour conditions shall be sufficiently safeguarded and where relevant enhanced. To that end the system requires that:	2	2	2	2
Health and safety	C 3.1. The forest manager must take adequate health and safety measures, at least in compliance with relevant legislation and in accordance with ILO conventions, in order to protect the personnel, including contractors and their employees and, where appropriate, the local and indigenous population.	=	≈	=	=
Employment conditions	C 3.2. Employees have the right to organise and negotiate wages and employment conditions, in accordance with national laws and the core conventions of the International Labour Organisation (ILO).	=	=	=	=
<b>Ecological Aspects</b>					
Biodiversity	P 4. Biodiversity shall be maintained and where possible enhanced. To that end the system requires that:	2	2	2	2
Species and Ecosystems	C 4.1. Objects of high ecological value and representative areas of forest types that occur within the forest management unit are identified, inventoried and protected.	=	=	=	=
	C 4.2. Protected and endangered plant and animal species are not exploited for commercial purposes. Where necessary, measures have been taken for their protection and, where relevant, increase of their population.	=	=	=	=
Conversion	C 4.3. Conversion of forests in the FMU to other types of land use, including timber plantations, shall not occur unless in justified exceptional circumstances.	=	=	=	=
Plantations	C 4.4. In case of plantations native species are preferred and a relevant proportion of the plantation shall be allowed to regenerate to natural forest.	=	=	=	=
	C 4.5. Plantations shall not be established through the conversion of natural forests after 1997.	=	=	=	=
Non-timber forest products, hunting and fishing	C 4.6. The exploitation of non-timber forest products, including hunting and fishing, are regulated, monitored and controlled. Insofar as relevant, knowledge of the local population, indigenous peoples, and locally active environmental organisations is utilised in monitoring commercial exploitation.	≈	=	≈	≈
Genetically modified organisms	C 4.7. Genetically modified organisms are not used.	=	=	=	=

Regulation functions	P 5. The regulation function and quality, health, and vitality of the forest shall be maintained and where possible enhanced. To that end the system requires that:	1	2	2	2
Soil	C 5.1. The soil quality of the forest management unit is maintained and, where necessary, improved, whereby special attention is given to shores, riverbanks, erosion-prone parts and slopes.	≈	=	=	≈
Water	C 5.2. The water balance and quality of both groundwater and surface water in the forest management unit, as well as downstream (outside of the forest management unit), are maintained and, where necessary, improved.	≈	=	=	=
Ecological cycles	C 5.3. Important ecological cycles, including carbon and nutrient cycles, which occur in the forest management unit, are at least maintained.	≈	=	=	=
Reduced impact logging	C 5.4. Avoidable damage to the ecosystem is prevented by application of the most suitable and available methods and techniques for logging and road construction under the prevailing conditions.	=	=	=	=
Forest fires	C 5.5. Initiating of forest fires is only permitted if that is necessary for the achievement of the management goals of the forest management unit and adequate safety measures are taken.	≠	≠	=	=
Diseases and pests	C 5.6. Forest management is geared towards preventing and controlling diseases and pests, inasmuch as they threaten the timber production.	=	=	=	=
Chemicals	C 5.7. The use of chemicals is only permitted if maximum use of ecological processes and sustainable alternatives proves insufficient. The use of class 1A and 1B pesticides, as drafted by the World Health Organisation, and of chlorinated hydrocarbons is not permitted.	=	=	=	=
Waste and litter	C 5.8. Non-organic waste and litter are avoided, collected, stored in the designated places and removed in an environmentally responsible manner.	=	=	=	=
<b>Economic Aspects</b>					
Production function	P 6. The production capacity of timber and relevant non-timber forest products shall be maintained. To that end the system requires that:	2	2	2	2
Production capacity	C 6.1. The production capacity of each forest type of the forest management unit as a whole is maintained.	=	=	=	=
Contribution to local economy	P 7. Forest management shall contribute to the local economy and employment. To that end the system requires that:	LDCs:1 ICs:2	2	1	2
Employment	C 7.1. Forest management stimulates employment of the local population, including indigenous peoples, as well as the local processing of timber and non-timber forest	=	=	=	=

	products.				
Infrastructure	C 7.2. Insofar as not provided for otherwise, a contribution is made to the development of local physical infrastructure and of social services and programmes for the local population, including indigenous peoples. This contribution is made in agreement with the local population.	LDCs: ≠ ICs: c.o.	c.o.	≈	=
<b>Management Aspects</b>					
Management system	P 8. Sustainable forest management shall be realised through a management system. To that end the system requires that:	2	2	2	2
Management cycle	C 8.1. Forest management aims to achieve the goals formulated in the forest management plan and comprises the cycle of inventory and analysis, planning, implementation, monitoring, evaluation, and improvement.	=	=	=	=
Forest management plan	C 8.2. There is a forest management plan, consisting of, or dealing with at least: a. a description of the current condition of the forest management unit b. long-term objectives c. the average annually allowable cut per forest type, and, if relevant, the annual allowable exploitation of non-timber forest products, based on reliable and current data d. budget for the implementation of the forest management plan.	=	≈	=	=
Maps	C 8.3. Essential elements for forest management are indicated on maps.	=	=	=	=
Monitoring	C 8.4. The implementation of the forest management plan and the ecological, social, and economic effects of forest management on the FMU and its surroundings are monitored periodically on the basis of adequate data.	=	=	=	=
Knowledge and expertise	C 8.5. Forest management is based on scientific research and, if needed, information on comparable forests types.	=	=	=	=
	C 8.6. Forests are managed by professional staff and forest workers. Adequate periodic training secures the level of skills, including knowledge of relevant laws and treaties.	=	=	=	=
Management group or regional association	P 9. Forest management in a group or regional association shall offer sufficient safeguards for sustainable forest management. To that end the system requires that:	2	2	2	2
Group or regional association	C 9.1. A group or regional association is under the leadership and supervision of an independent legal entity.	=	=	=	=
	C 9.2. The management system of a group or regional association offers sufficient guarantee to fulfil criterion 9.3.	=	=	=	=
Sustainable forest management requirements	C 9.3. A group or regional association complies with the requirements set by the SFM standard of the certification system. In addition, each member of a group or regional association complies with these requirements, inasmuch as they apply to its operations.	=	=	=	=

## Chain of Custody (CoC) and Logo Use

Chain of Custody system	P 1. A Chain of Custody (CoC) must be in place from the forest unit of origin to the final point of sale, which provides a link between the certified material in the product or product line and certified forest units. To that end the system requires that:	2
Organisation	C 1.1 Each individual organisation in the CoC possesses an operational CoC system.	=
	C 1.2 The management system of each organisation in the CoC provides sufficient guarantees that the requirements of the CoC standard are being met.	=
	C 1.3 Each individual organisation in the CoC registers quantities and the names and certificate numbers of the organisations from which it purchases timber and to which it sells timber.	=
Legal sources	C 1.4 If the system allows for mixing of SFM-certified and non-SFM-certified material, the non-SFM certified material is covered by a verifiable system to ensure that it is from non-disputed, at least legal sources. This applies to new-, including pre-consumer recycled material, and post-consumer recycled material.	=
	C1.5 SFM-certified timber, including timber products, timber from other verified legal sources and timber from non-verified (legal) sources are administratively separated. Timber from non-verified (legal) sources is also physically separated from the other two sources.	=
Mixed wood and assembled products	C1.6 If the system allows for mixing of SFM-certified and non-SFM-certified material, (one of) the following approaches shall be used: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. mass balance claim: the proportion of the product sold as SFM certified is equal to the proportion of SFM certified material entering a process;</li> <li>b. percentage based claim: the percentage of SFM certified material in a product or product line is reported.</li> </ul>	=
Chain of Custody group certification	P 2. If Group certification of the CoC is allowed, the standard must require that the group as whole must comply with the same requirements which are posed on individual companies. To that end the system requires that:	2
Juridical entity	C 2.1 A group has a juridical entity, which is responsible for the group as a whole.	=
Management	C 2.2 The group has a management system that provides sufficient guarantees that C 2.3 will be met.	=
	C 2.3 The group operates according to principle 1; in addition, each member of the group complies with these requirements inasmuch as they apply to its operations.	=
Registration	C 2.4 The group leader has a registration system in place including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. names and addresses of the group members</li> <li>b. declarations of each member to comply with the certification requirements of the CoC.</li> </ul>	=
Logos and labels	P 3. Logos and labels that belong to the certification system and occur on products and documents shall have an unambiguous meaning and shall be applied in accordance with the rules established by the certification system. To that end the system requires that:	2
Design and use of logos and labels	C 3.1. The system manager employs rules for the use of logos and labels and for supervision of compliance. The rules comprise at least: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. specification of the logos and labels</li> <li>b. unambiguous description of the claim that the logos and labels</li> </ul>	=

	<p>represent, including the requirement to communicate the actual or minimum percentages of SFM certified- and post-consumer recycled material included in the product or product line</p> <p>c. rights to use logos and labels</p> <p>d. instructions regarding the use of logos and labels and the informative text they show.</p>	
Copyright	C 3.2. The logo is copyrighted and is a registered trademark.	=
Clear and accurate claims	C 3.3 There is a clearly defined mechanism for controlling all claims made about the certified nature of products, which ensures that claims are clear and accurate and that action is taken to prevent any false or misleading claims.	=

## Development, Application and Management (DAM) of certification systems

Standard Development and Application		FSC Int.	FSC Sweden	FSC Brazil	ICILA (Cam.)
Standard development	P 1. The process of standard development and the standard itself shall fulfil the requirements as established by international umbrella organisations (such as ISO and ISEAL). To that end the system requires that:	2	2	2	*)
ISEAL and ISO Guide 59	C 1.1. The development process of the standard fulfils the requirements established in the <i>ISEAL 'Code of Good Practice for Setting Social and Environmental Standards'</i> , the <i>ISO Guide 59 'Code of Good Practice for Standardisation'</i> or equivalent requirements. The development process and application of the standard at least fulfil the following criteria: 1.2. through 1.10; 2.1. and 2.2.; 3.3. through 3.6. of this assessment table.	=	=	=	=
Stakeholder input	C 1.2. The standard development body comprises the relevant interested groups that serve the economic, social and environmental interests without undue dominance of one interest.	=	=	=	≈
	C 1.3 Decisions of the standard development body are made, if possible, by consensus. If consensus is not reached, qualified majority voting applies.	=	*)	*)	*)
	C 1.4. The development of the standard takes place with input of the relevant stakeholders. Potential limitations for certain groups such as indigenous peoples and small forest owners to contribute directly are taken into account.	=	=	=	=
Public consultation	C 1.5. The standard development procedure provides for public input during a reasonable period of time.	=	=	=	=
Justification for handling comments	C 1.6. With the development of the standard, the standard setting organisation takes into account any comments submitted in writing and communicated verbally. The organisation maintains reports of the development process of the standard including the received input and how it is dealt with. A summary of it is published and is freely available.	≈	≈	≈	≈
Publication	C 1.7. The standard setting organisation publishes the standard as soon as it has been established.	=	=	=	=
Reference to international standards	C 1.8. A national standard which is part of an international certification system with a generic standard or which is based on a generic standard of an umbrella organisation, must refer to the relevant generic standard and be accepted by the relevant international system or organisation.	=	=	=	=
General applicability	C 1.9. The standard and the procedures for establishing compliance are sufficiently flexible to be applied under changing local conditions and to forest management units of any size, either as a part of a group or regional association or otherwise.	=	=	=	=



Process criteria and performance criteria	C 1.10. The standard contains both process and performance criteria and consists, where appropriate, of measurable, unambiguous parameters with guidelines for interpretation.	=	=	=	=
<b>Certification system management</b>					
System manager	P 2. The certification system shall be managed by a legal entity (system manager). The tasks and responsibilities shall be clearly distributed among the organisations, which form an organisational and/or functional part of the system. To that end the system requires that:	2	2	2	2
Legal entity, statutes	C 2.1. The system manager is a legally registered organisation with statutes, contact address, telephone, e-mail, and website.	=	=	=	=
Entities, distribution of responsibilities	C 2.2. The distribution of the responsibilities, authorities, and tasks among the entities, comprising an organisational and/or functional part of the certification system, and the procedures to be followed are clear and publicly available. The certification system comprises at least rules for the following functions: a. standard development b. certification c. accreditation d. supervision of proper performance of tasks and compliance with the rules e. objection and appeal handling f. design and use of logos and labels	=	=	=	=
Decision-making bodies and objection and appeal procedures	P 3. Decision-making bodies shall reflect the interests of stakeholders and shall provide for adequate procedures for objection and appeal regarding the decisions made and the functioning of the decision-making bodies. To that end the system requires that:	1	1	1	1
Composition	C 3.1. The decision-making and advisory bodies comprise the relevant interested groups without undue dominance of one interest.	=	≈	≈	=
Decision-making	C 3.2. Decisions of decision-making and advisory bodies are made, if possible, by consensus. If consensus is not reached, majority voting applies.	=	=	=	=
Provision for objection or appeal	C 3.3. Objection and appeal procedures are publically available and clearly indicate the entity a stakeholder must turn to in the event of an objection or appeal against the operation of a particular entity or against a decision made by a particular entity.	≈	≈	≈	≈
Justification	C 3.4. The objection and appeal procedures require that the submitter or a representative substantiates the objection or appeal with arguments and relevant documentation.	=	=	=	=
Reasonable period	C 3.5. Objection and appeal procedures contain clear and reasonable deadlines for handling of the objection or appeal.	=	=	=	=

Independent forum	C 3.6. A forum of independent persons, which adequately represent legal and domain knowledge, handles appeal cases. Decisions are taken by majority voting.	≠	≠	≠	≠
<b>Certification Bodies and Certification Procedures</b>					
Certification bodies and procedures	P 4. Certification bodies shall be independent and shall be competent to assess sustainable forest management and the chain of custody system. To that end the system requires that:	2	2	2	2
Certification bodies	C 4.1. The certification bodies are accredited on the basis of the requirements and guidelines in ISO 17021 <sup>3</sup> 'Conformity Assessment - Requirements for Bodies Providing Audit and Certification of Management Systems' and/or ISO Guide 65 (EN 45011) 'General Requirements for Bodies Operating Product Certification Systems' and preferably on the basis of specific supplemental requirements for performance of conformity assessments according to the standards for sustainable forest management and the chain of custody.	=	=	=	=
Procedure for assessment	C 4.2. The certification contains an assessment of system documents, site visits, and sufficient consultation of external stakeholders.	=	=	=	=
	C 4.3. In case of a group certification an adequate sample of group members must be audited.	=	=	=	=
Public availability	C 4.4. The certification agency makes the following items public in addition to the requirements in ISO 17021 and ISO Guide 65: a. summaries of assessment reports b. a list of the granted certificates	=	=	=	=
<b>Accreditation</b>					
Accreditation	P 5. The accreditation agencies that grant the accreditations for certification of sustainable forest management and/or the chain of custody shall be competent and independent, national or international organisations that are preferably member of the IAF. To that end the system requires that:	1	1	1	1
Accreditation body	C 5.1. Accreditation must be granted by a national or international organisation that fulfils requirements as included in ISO 17011 'General Requirements for Assessment and Accreditation of Certification Bodies'.	=	=	=	=
Peer review	C 5.2. The accreditation body takes part in a peer review process with sister organisations, preferably within the framework of the IAF.	≠	≠	≠	≠

\*) DAM C1.3 was included in the Dutch Procurement Criteria after TPAC made the cross-check for FSC Sweden, Brazil and ICILA, this criterion has therefor the been scored.

<sup>3</sup> ISO 17021 has replaced ISO Guide 62 (EN 45012) and ISO Guide 66. A transition period applies. ISO Guide 62 (EN 45012) and ISO Guide 66 may be used until September 2008.